

#	Design Components <sup>1</sup>	Solution Options <sup>2</sup>		
		Status Quo	A	B
<b>0. General structure</b>				
1	Rate structure	Multiple regional/RTO-wide rates based on transaction types and behavior	Single RTO-wide fixed rate with true-up	Single RTO-wide fixed rate with deferred balance
2a	What period of time the rate applies to	Daily	Monthly (based on prior month)	Monthly (based on rolling average)
2b	How is rate calculated			
3	Unusual circumstances	No specific treatment	Handle through true-up	Deferred balance with true-up for excess
4	Transactions that rate applies to	Everything listed below (DC# 5-25)	Realtime load, exports, imports, wheels, incs, decs, UTCs, realtime generation, economic demand response, emergency demand response	Deviations only (includes all virtuals). Wheels when realtime deviates from day ahead
<b>1. Resources (gen and econ DR)/imports cleared in DA market</b>				
5	DAOR allocation: Resource/transaction	DA Load, DA Exports, DECs	NA (DAOR Eliminated)	Day ahead load, day ahead exports, decs not associated with resources <b>within one's portfolio</b>
6	DAOR allocation: Region	Entire RTO	NA (DAOR Eliminated)	
13	BOR allocation: Resource/transaction	RT Load (metered), RT Exports --- Deviations	DA Load, DA Interchange Transactions and Virtuals	Transmissions outages that cause uplift in real-time would be allocated a share of uplift <b>(need to define a MW value)</b>
14	BOR allocation: Region	East/West < 500 kV --- RTO >= 500 kV	Entire RTO	status quo + double 345kV circuits
17	Cancellation charges allocation: Resource/transaction	Deviations	Physical Deviations (Load, Gen/DR and Interchange Transactions deviations)	<b>status quo + RT interchange (if not following a DA schedule)</b>
18	Cancellation charges allocation: Region	RTO		
19	Deviations categories	Demand, Supply, Generators/DR	Eliminate this allocation	<b>status quo + RT interchange (if not following a DA schedule)</b>
19a	Transactions in generator/DR category	Generators and DR		

19b	Transactions in demand deviation category	Load, Exports, DECs, IBT Sales	Eliminate this allocation	Load, Exports, DECs not located at or associated with physical resources within one's portfolio, IBT Sales
19c	Transactions in supply deviation category	Imports, INCs, IBT Purchases	Eliminate this allocation	Imports, INCs not located at or associated with physical load within a market participant's portfolio, IBT Purchases
22	Transactions DA vs RT netting	Same type of category in same hour in same: zone, hub/aggregate, interface	<del>Status quo modified by netting of multiple categories of transactions within the same hour.</del>	<b>Status quo + netting of multiple categories (types) of transactions within the same hour if transacted by same market participant at the same location</b>
23	Generators netting	Same hour, same bus, same impact on transmission system		
25	Reliability vs deviation logic (RT: Real time)	Reliability: LMP <= Offer for at least four 5-minute intervals for all operating hours Deviation: LMP > Offer for at least four 5-minute intervals for any operating hours	Eliminate this allocation	For resources with min run-time of <= 3 hours or less: Reliability: LMP <= Offer for at least six 5-minute intervals for all operating hours Deviation: LMP > Offer for at least six 5-minute intervals for any operating hours For resources with a min run time of >3 hours: Reliability: LMP <= Offer for at least eighteen 5-minute intervals for all operating hours Deviation: LMP > Offer for at least eighteen 5-minute intervals for any operating hours
<b>2. Resources (gen and econ DR)/Imports not cleared in DA mkt and committed up to and including RT</b>				
13	BOR allocation: Resource/transaction	RT Load (metered), RT Exports --- Deviations	RT Load, RT Exports --- Deviations --- Physical Deviations	Deviations - Physical deviations
14	BOR allocation: Region	East/West < 500 kV --- RTO >= 500 kV	<b>status quo + double 345kV circuits</b>	

17	Cancellation charges allocation: Resource/transaction	Deviations	Physical Deviations (Load, Gen/DR and Interchange Transactions deviations)	RT Load (metered), RT Exports --- Deviations + RT Imports (Interchange Deviations from DA schedule for imports and exports)
18	Cancellation charges allocation: Region	RTO		
19	Deviations categories	Demand, Supply, Generators/DR		<b>status quo + real-time interchange (if not following DA schedule)</b>
19a	Transactions in generator/DR category	Generators and DR		
19b	Transactions in demand deviation category	Load, Exports, DECs, IBT Sales	Status quo plus withdraw side of UTC/Wheels. Exclude IBT sale	Load, Exports, DECs not associated with generation within a market participants portfolio, IBT Sales
19c	Transactions in supply deviation category	Imports, INCs, IBT Purchases	Status quo plus injection-side of UTC/Wheels. Exclude IBT purchases	Imports, INCs not associated with load within a market participants portfolio, IBT Purchases?????
22	Transactions DA vs RT netting	Same type of category in same hour in same: zone, hub/aggregate, interface	<b>Status quo + netting of multiple categories types of transactions within the same hour if transacted by same market participant at the same location</b>	
23	Generators netting	Same hour, same bus, same impact on transmission system		
24	Reliability vs deviation logic (RA: Reliability analysis)	Reliability: Maintain system reliability Deviation: Meet forecasted load plus reserves	If for reliability -> RT Load + RT Exports, rest Deviations	All to Deviations

25	Reliability vs deviation logic (RT: Real time)	Reliability: LMP <= Offer for at least four 5-minute intervals for all operating hours Deviation: LMP > Offer for at least four 5-minute intervals for any operating hours	If for reliability -> RT Load + RT Exports, rest Physical Deviations (Load, Gen/DR and Interchange Transactions deviations)	All to Physical Deviations
<b>3. Units are cleared in DA mkt not committed in real time (LOC credit)</b>				
15	LOC allocation: Resource/transaction	Deviations in entire RTO		
16	LOC allocation: Region	Deviations in entire RTO		
19	Deviations categories	Demand, Supply, Generators/DR		
19a	Transactions in generator/DR category	Generators and DR		
19b	Transactions in demand deviation category	Load, Exports, DECs, IBT Sales	Include UTC/Wheels. Exclude IBT	
19c	Transactions in supply deviation category	Imports, INCs, IBT Purchases	Include UTC/Wheels. Exclude IBT	
22	Transactions DA vs RT netting	Same type of category in same hour in same: zone, hub/aggregate, interface	<b>Status quo + netting of multiple categories types of transactions within the same hour if transacted by same market participant at the same location</b>	
23	Generators netting	Same hour, same bus, same impact on transmission system		
<b>4. Units reduced for reliability in real time (LOC Credit)</b>				
15	LOC allocation: Resource/transaction	Deviations in entire RTO	Physical Deviations (Load, Gen/DR and Interchange Transactions deviations)	
16	LOC allocation: Region	Deviations in entire RTO		
19	Deviations categories	Demand, Supply, Generators/DR		
19a	Transactions in generator/DR category	Generators and DR		

19b	Transactions in demand deviation category	Load, Exports, DECs, IBT Sales	Load, DECs not associated with generation within a market participants portfolio, IBT Sales, Interchange not following a DA schedule	
19c	Transactions in supply deviation category	Imports, INCs, IBT Purchases	Imports, INCs not associated with load within a market participants portfolio, IBT Purchases, Interchange not following a DA schedule	
22	Transactions DA vs RT netting	Same type of category in same hour in same: zone, hub/aggregate, interface	<b>Status quo + netting of multiple categories types of transactions within the same hour if transacted by same market participant at the same location</b>	
23	Generators netting	Same hour, same bus, same impact on transmission system		
<b>5. Reactive</b>				
7	Reactive allocation: Resource/transaction	RT Load (metered)	RT Load if Tx < 500 kV RT Load, RT Exports and RT Wheels Tx >= 500 kV	
8	Reactive allocation: Region	Zone(s) < 500 KV --- RTO >= 500 kV		
<b>6. Black start</b>				
9	Black start allocation: Resource/transaction	RT Load (metered), RT Interchange Transactions Reservations		
10	Black start allocation: Region	Zone (Load) RTO (Interchange Transactions)		
<b>7. DASR</b>				
11	DAOR (DASR) allocation: Resource/transaction	DA Load, DA Exports, DECs	Same DASR allocation (RT Load)	DA Load, DA Exports, DECs not associated with generation within a market participants portfolio
12	DAOR (DASR) allocation: Region	Entire RTO		
<b>8. Misc. energy uplift allocation</b>				
27	Emergency DR	Net purchasers in the energy balancing market across the entire RTO (consider current filings)	RT Load (zonally when called by zone)	All participants

28	Economic DR	Same allocation provisions as generators explicitly covered in categories 1 and 2 (above).		
29	Emergency Purchases	Net purchasers in the energy balancing market across the entire RTO	<b>Net purchase positions in the balancing market and real-time interchange that is not scheduled DA</b>	
<b>9. Netting or other Out-of-Market Charges</b>				
26	Unallocated congestion (negative balancing congestion)	Same as DAOR: DA Load, DA Exports and DECs across the entire RTO	FTRs	DA Load, DA Exports, DECs not associated with generation within a market participants portfolio at the same location
30	Allocation of marginal loss surplus	Ratio shared to realtime load plus exports that pay for transmission services. Non-firm exports receive 31% of their allocations	<b>For periods (still to be defined) of inadequate operating reserve cost recovery via a new 'static' rate structure, deficiencies should resolved with money from the marginal loss overcollection.</b>	
31	Allocation of FTR surplus/balancing congestion surplus	Within a planning year, surplus carries over from month-to-month. And is used to fund any FTR deficiencies from previous months within the planning year. If any excess surplus exists at the end of the planning year, can be used to fulfill ARR deficiencies. If no deficiencies exist, surplus will be allocated proportionally to FTR holders with positive target allocations.		

**Instru**

<sup>1</sup>Design Components - each is an "attribute" or "component" of any proposed solution. Consensus of the group should be sought on selection of a set of solutions.

<sup>2</sup>Solution Options - each is a solution alternative elicited from the stakeholder group that meet one of the specific solution criteria.

**To complete the matrix:**

1. Elicit from the stakeholder group a set of components (attributes) desired for any proposed solution. Enter a short label for each in the Design Components

2. If needed, enter a more detailed description of each criteria on the "Component Details" tab.
3. Using informal/non-binding voting, rate each component's priority in the final solution as "high/medium/low"
4. Elicit from the stakeholder group potential solution alternative(s) for each component. Enter a short label for each in the Solution Options columns.
5. If needed, enter a more detailed description of each potential solution option on the "Solution Details" tab.
6. Once the matrix is filled out, the group will attempt to select a single solution alternative (column) for each component (row) to form a solution "package".  
Example: cells 1B, 2C, 3A, 4B, 5D could make up a solution package.
7. If consensus is achieved on a single package (Tier 1 decision-making method), this will be documented in a Consensus Proposal Report to the parent comr
8. If not, the group will identify up to 3 possible solution packages in a comparative Proposal Alternatives Report to the parent committee (Tier 2 decsion-makir

C	D	E	F
Takes status quo, but eliminate regional rates. Everything allocated RTO-wide.	Regional fixed rate with true-up	Regional fixed rate with deferred balance	
Annually (based on prior year+an adder)	Weekly rates		
Status quo up to a certain dollar amount. Costs are allocated differently above given dollar amount.			



No switching logic. If a unit is brought on for the reason of reliability, it should be charged to reliability regardless of LMP being higher than the cost of the unit for certain intervals.			
RT Load (metered), RT Exports + RT Imports (Interchange Deviations from DA schedule)			





<p>For resources with min run-time of <math>\leq 3</math> hours or less: Reliability: LMP <math>\leq</math> Offer for at least six 5-minute intervals for all operating hours</p> <p>Deviation: LMP <math>&gt;</math> Offer for at least six 5-minute intervals for any operating hours</p> <p>For resources with a min run time of <math>&gt;3</math> hours: Reliability: LMP <math>\leq</math> Offer for at least eighteen 5-minute intervals for all operating hours</p> <p>Deviation: LMP <math>&gt;</math> Offer for at least eighteen 5-minute intervals for any operating hours</p>	<p>No switching logic. If a unit is brought on for the reason of reliability, it should be charged to reliability regardless of LMP being higher than the cost of the unit for certain intervals.</p>		






on criteria.

column.

nittee.  
ng method).













\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_















\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_















\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_













\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_







[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]







\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

